

[Dr. Sam Eatherton is an outstanding church musician and composer. He recently left his position at Trinity Lutheran Church & School, Sheboygan WI and now serves as assistant professor of Practical Theology and as kantor and director of musical arts at Concordia Seminary, St. Louis. A former student of Charles Ore. Graduate (PhD) of Baylor University. He has done considerable research in the area of church music, especially in the area of "Children's Song in the Lutheran Church." Has presented at the church music conference in Uppsala, Sweden. Sam spearheaded the festschrift for David W. Music---*The Gift of Music: Essays on Church Music and Hymnology*. (MorningStar 2021)]

Fifty Years of Children in Lutheran Church Music: 1883-1933

Samuel J. Eatherton

Research in Church Music History

MUS 6343

Dr. David Music

Baylor University

April 11, 2016

But when the chief priests and the scribes saw the wonderful things that he did, and the children crying out in the temple, "Hosanna to the Son of David!" they were indignant, and they said to him, "Do you hear what these are saying?" And Jesus said to them, "Yes; have you never read,

"Out of the mouth of infants and nursing babies you have prepared praise?"¹

The Evangelist Matthew records this scene following Jesus' triumphal entry into Jerusalem at the onset of Holy Week. In this narrative, Christ had just driven out the money changers and those selling pigeons and was healing the blind and the lame when the scribes and Pharisees become incensed with the scene. The children praising the Son of David seems to be the catalyst that induces them to confront Jesus, and it is to that singular action that He replies. Christ not only upholds the praises of the children but uses Psalm 8—a text the Pharisees surely would have known—to support his affirmation of them.² Applying this Biblical indication that children are fit to proclaim the works of God, Christians throughout the ages have been faced with the responsibility of raising their children as "praisers of God." Those in the Lutheran church, following Martin Luther's lead, have paid special attention to the teaching of their children through the various educational programs of the church, and, also taking Luther's viewpoint, they have regarded the music of the church as having a chief role in this process of faith formation. How did these two aspects of early Lutheran practice—the teaching

¹ Matthew 21:15-16 (ESV). The 1954 Lutheran children's hymnal, *Our Songs of Praise* uses this story in its preface to the teacher's edition to introduce its rationale for the education of children in the hymns within the volume. Edward W. Klammer, *Our Songs of Praise* (Saint Louis, Mo: Concordia Pub. House, 1953), iv.

² Martin Luther, in his commentary on Psalm 8:2 states, "This is the way Christ's kingdom is established, namely, not with human force, wisdom, counsel or power, but with the Word and the Gospel preached by infants and sucklings." Martin Luther, *Selected Psalms I*, Vol. 12, *Luther's Works, American Edition* (St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House and Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1968), 108. For a fascinating discourse on the interaction between Jesus and children by a modern Lutheran scholar, see Martin E. Marty, *The Mystery of the Child* (Grand Rapids, Mich: William B. Eerdmans, 2007), 70-100.

of children and church music-manifest themselves nearly 400 years later in the writings of Lutherans in America?

A good deal of interest in the music of children was evident in late 19th century Lutheranism. Consider the many children's hymnals published between 1880 and 1901 alone. At least 13 children's hymnals were published by the various Lutheran bodies in America within this 21 year period.³ In addition to this explosion of publications for children within the context of the Sunday school, a renewed curiosity in the heritage of the Lutheran church, specifically in relation to its liturgy and hymns, brought the role of children and church music into sharper focus. Culminating in the publication of the *Common Service* of 1888,⁴ this new liturgical interest spurred discussion of children's music in church music circles, represented in a number of articles written by Lutheran pastors and teachers around the turn of the century. The views of church music in the parochial schools of the Lutheran churches also comprise a significant part of the discussion and will be the subject of the final section of this paper. A review of these sources by Lutheran pastors, musicians, and educators confirms the prominent place of church music in the teaching of children between 1883 and 1933 and points to three main themes: the importance of education, the choice of hymns with doctrinal integrity, and the active participation of children in the music of the congregation.

³ Samuel J. Eatherton, "Lutheran Sunday School Hymnals in English-1819-1901," (Unpublished manuscript, Baylor University 2015), 5. See also Jon D. Vieker, "The Father's Faith, the Children's Song: Missouri Lutheranism Encounters American Evangelicalism in Its Hymnals, Hymns Writers, and Hymns, 1889-1912," (PhD diss., Concordia Seminary, St. Louis, 2014). Vieker's dissertation contains a chapter on the 1901 Missouri Synod Sunday school hymnal. Apart from Vieker's work and my own, I am not aware of any other research that has been undertaken in regard to the Sunday school hymnody of the Lutheran church.

⁴ General Synod of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in the United States, *The Common Service for the Use of Evangelical Lutheran Congregations* (Philadelphia: Lutheran Publications Society, 1888).

From the very beginning of the Reformation, the Lutheran church took a keen interest in both the education of children and the use of music in worship to proclaim the Word of God. It is evident from Luther's writings that he was concerned for the musical training of the children in school. In 1524 he wrote "To the Councilmen of All Cities in Germany That They Establish and Maintain Christian Schools," encouraging "singing and music" to be taught along with the other subjects.⁵ In his 1528 "Instructions for the Visitors of Parish Pastors in Electoral Saxony," he provides recommendations for the division of the school children into various singing groups according to age and ability, even suggesting times during the school day the groups should be rehearsed. In a letter written in 1542 Luther indicates that the children's participation in the church service will provide a leadership role for the adults to follow: "The common people will learn from the pupils what, when, and how to sing and pray in church."⁶ Luther advocated the teaching of music in the schools, tied its use directly to the worship of the congregation, and advanced the notion that schoolmasters and pastors should be practiced in music and able to sing.⁷ Combining an attention to both church music and children, the church of the Lutheran Reformation taught its music to the children in its parochial schools so that they would know the music of the various services and could actively participate in worship with the adults.

As the first Lutheran immigrants settled in America in the 18th century, they often started schools, which used the music of the church in their devotions and daily exercises. By the early 1800s, many of these long-established Lutheran Americans began to support the

⁵ See Carl Schalk, *Luther on Music: Paradigms of Praise* (St. Louis: Concordia, 1988), 28-29. For the use of music as proclamation, see pp. 37-39.

⁶ *Ibid.*, 29.

⁷ *Ibid.*, 30.

institution of the public school system and, in so doing, contributed to the weakening of their own parochial school system.⁸ As early as 1816,⁹ they began to adopt the model of the Sunday school from neighboring protestant churches in order to educate their children in religious matters, and this model included singing hymns.¹⁰ When the Lutheran immigrants from Scandinavia and Germany settled in the mid-west toward the middle and later part of the 19th century, many started their own schools, usually with hymnals in their native tongues. While hymnals in the German language, for instance, continued to be published into the last quarter of the 19th century¹¹ by the final two decades one begins to see a proliferation of English language Sunday school hymnals, and with them an increased interest in the kind of music children were taught within the Lutheran church.¹² With the 1883 publication of the *Sunday*

⁸ "Since the establishment of public schools in this country, the Luth. Church has generally patronized them." Henry Eyster Jacobs, John Augustus William Haas, and Otto Zockler, "Education," in *The Lutheran Cyclopaedia* (New York : Charles Scribner's Sons), 1899, 163. For a brief history of Lutheran schools in America, see also "Parochial Schools," p. 367 and "Teacher's Seminaries," p. 506 in the same source.

⁹ Eatherton, "Lutheran Sunday School Hymnals," 6.

¹⁰ The first documented Lutheran Sunday school hymnal was published in 1819. Ibid.

¹¹ "The General Council's *Kirchenbuch* was the last major collection of German Lutheran hymnody in America. After its appearance in 1877, no American Lutheran church body produced a significantly new addition to the corpus of German language hymnody." Carl Schalk, *God's Song in a New Land: Lutheran Hymnals in America* (St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House, 1995), 150.

¹² Prior to 1883, prefaces in English Lutheran Sunday school hymnals-and not all contained prefaces-concerned themselves with practical matters such as the methodology of compiling the hymnal, acknowledgement of people who assisted, the circumstance(s) that led to the creation of the hymnal, and the like. Take, for instance, the 1860 *Hymns for Sunday-Schools* of the General Synod, the first officially sanctioned, synod-wide Sunday school hymnal in the Lutheran church in America. (See Eatherton, "Lutheran Sunday School Hymnals," 5.) The preface to this hymnal has no reference to the purpose for children learning hymnody in the Lutheran church; its corresponding tune book, *Carmina Ecclesiae* (1860), is likewise silent. The 1873 *Sunday School Book* of the General Council contains no preface. This is not to say these books were unconcerned with children's music in the church or in the Sunday school; indeed, their very existence shows that church leaders wanted children to be learning hymns and songs. But the apparent lack of discretion in selecting theologically sound hymnody and the absence of prefaces fleshing out a rationale for sacred music in a child's education stand in contrast to the later hymnals that are reviewed in this study.

School Hymnal by the Evangelical Lutheran Joint Synod of Ohio, we see the first instance of a Lutheran Sunday school hymnal with prefatory material condemning what was seen as trivial texts and music derived from sources outside the Lutheran church. Like others that would follow, this hymnal preface also sets forth a philosophy of what children should be learning in regard to the music of the church.¹³ Editor John Spielman writes,

Never was the need of a reformation in Sunday School hymnology, as well as Sunday School music, more seriously felt than now, when the prevailing popular taste has lost almost every trace of the sound Evangelical spirit of the grand Church of the Reformation. The contemptible catering for the viciated [sic] taste of the thoughtless and amusement loving, by equally giddy or selfinterested persons, has so increased the morbid craving for the unchurchly, frivolous and inane effusions that, it seems, the unnatural appetite for them cannot be sated. Even in our own schools and amongst our own youth this soft sentimentalism has occasionally cropped out, so that the need of wholesome check upon its unchurchly spirit and enervating influence is a matter of the gravest importance.¹⁴

Apparently the uncritical choices of music for children in the Lutheran Sunday schools by that time prompted Spielman and others in the Joint Synod of Ohio to preface their own hymnal with a statement of what they saw as a deplorable state of children's music. Spielman's use of the word "unchurchly" implies that the music of the Sunday school should conform to

¹³ It should be noted that the General Council, in preparing the 1873 *Sunday School Book* was aware of the need for closer attention to be paid toward children's hymnody. The editors of the 1899 *Lutheran Cyclopedia* state, "From the very beginning the General Council recognized the importance of giving to our Sunday-Schools a Tune and Service Book which, while 'rejecting all sensationalism, and all conformity to a merely popular style' should be in harmony with the spirit of the Church, and help to educate the young to an intelligent and appreciative participation in the services of the house of God." Henry Eyster Jacobs, John Augustus William Haas, and Otto Zockler, *The Lutheran Cyclopedia* (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1899), 468. However, the 1873 hymnal does not include this information in a preface. In fact, rather than a preface, the hymnal contains a brief acknowledgement of several of the sources from which it drew a substantial portion of its material-and, ironically, considering *The Lutheran Cyclopedia's* comment above, those noted are all from sources outside the Lutheran church. One explanation for this may be that the Lutheran church of the time had not produced any notable hymn writers in English and thus had to borrow from other sources. See Eatherton, "Lutheran Sunday School Hymnals," and General Council of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in America, *Sunday-School Book for the Use of Evangelical Lutheran Congregations* (Philadelphia: Lutheran Book Store, 1873).

¹⁴ Evangelical Lutheran Joint Synod of Ohio and Other States, *The Sunday School Hymnal: a Collection of Music for Sunday and Week-Day Schools with Full Responsive Services for Sundays and Festivals* (Columbus, Ohio: Lutheran Book Concern, 1883.) iii.

the same sense of propriety accorded to music in the church. He goes on to point out the use of familiar chorales, or "church tunes," as beneficial to children and even goes so far as to commend their use in "every Christian hymnal."¹⁵ Without explicitly stating that the music of the Sunday school is preparation for singing the music of the church, Spielman yet affirms the strong tie between the music taught to children in educational settings of the church and the type of music to be sung in the regular services of the congregation. In addition, he commends the hymnal's use to "Congregational Schools, Catechetical Classes, and the family circle."¹⁶ The Joint Synod of Ohio,¹⁷ with the publication of its 1883 *Sunday School Hymnal*, is notable for being the first to address the educational venues for the hymnody (church, school, and home) in conjunction with a concern for doctrinal purity and its linking of children's music with the music of the church.

Jeremiah Franklin Ohl, a Lutheran Pastor in Pennsylvania,¹⁸ published his *School and Parish Hymnal with Tunes* in 1892. While the editor had in mind various congregational groups

¹⁵ Ibid., iv.

¹⁶ Ibid.

¹⁷ The Joint Synod of Ohio and Other States issued another Sunday school hymnal in 1914, *School Carols: A Collection of Hymns for the Sunday Schools*, which is even more explicit in the focus of children's singing as forming their life of worship. "The book is based upon a recognition of worship as a vital element in religious education, and the conviction that the music which is to be a part of that worship should be devotional and churchly in its character, melodious and singable, and expressive of the faith and purposes of the Christian life." Evangelical Lutheran Joint Synod of Ohio and Other States, *School Carols: A Collection of Hymns for the Sunday Schools* (Columbus, Ohio: Lutheran Book Concern, 1914), 3.

¹⁸ As of 1890 Ohl was Pastor in Quakertown, Pennsylvania and had "devoted much time to the study of liturgies, hymnology, and church music, especially the latter...." Jens Christian Roseland, "Rev. J.F. Ohl, A.M.," in *American Lutheran Biographies: Or, Historical Notices of Over Three Hundred and Fifty Leading Men of the American Lutheran Church, from Its Establishment to the Year 1890; with a Historical Introduction and Numerous Portrait Engravings* (Milwaukee, Wis: Press of A. Houtkamp & Son, 1890), 561. According to this source, Ohl was also chief editor of the General Council's infant school hymnal, *Little Children's Book for Schools and Families* (1885), a fact that is not indicated within the hymnal itself. However, the preface compares favorably in tone to that of Ohl's 1892 hymnal. *Little Children's Book* is intended for young children but includes forms of the Matins

(including the day school) when compiling his hymnal, he asserts that its chief purpose is that of a Sunday school hymnal. What follows is the most complete exposition of thought up to that time regarding the kind of music that should be taught to children of the church, grounded in the "conviction that only the best is good enough for children."¹⁹

He first takes issue with the "popular notion that the words and music in which a child is taught to express its devotions, must be radically different from the hymns and tunes used by adult Christians," contending that children need to be taught the same "objective realities of faith" as adults. In the next paragraph he attacks the "intense subjectiveness" of current Sunday-School hymnology, writing,

"While this is a quality that should never predominate in a hymn for public worship, it should least of all characterize a hymn used by children. Yet much of the popular Sunday-School hymnology teaches children to sing more of self-their feelings, wishes, and intentions-than of God, and to give expression to sentiments that in children are unreal, unnatural, and morbid."²⁰

Ohl's comment echoes the views of the compilers of the 1883 *Sunday School Hymnal* and foreshadows the comments of Frederic Reddall who wrote an 1896 article for the *Lutheran Church Review* titled "Decadence of Sunday School Music." In this article Reddall remarks that

and Vespers services of the Lutheran church "as far as practicable for use with little children" and commends its use for schools and families at home. According to the preface, the committee selected "such hymns and tunes as combine substantial merit with child-like simplicity," and the influence of an educator such as Ohl is apparent in the statement, "Still, it is believed that the book does not contain a single hymn or tune that little children can not [sic] learn, provided they have a faithful, persevering, and patient teacher." The author also takes the opportunity to hint at the importance of theologically sound hymns for the life of the child: "Moreover, children should in early life be made familiar with the best hymns and tunes, as only these will retain their place and influence, when mere childish pieces, like the toys of early years, have been laid aside." The similarity of these statements to Ohl's 1892 preface, together with the attestation of Roseland in the 1890 *American Lutheran Biographies* make Ohl a likely candidate for the authorship of the preface to *Little Children's Book*. General Council of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in North America, *Little Children's Book for Schools and Families* (Philadelphia: J.C. File, 1885), 3-4.

¹⁹ Ohl, J. F. (Jeremiah Franklin), *School and Parish Hymnal with Tunes* (Philadelphia : G.W. Frederick, 1892).

²⁰ Ibid., 3-4.

"the common run of Sunday school hymns-words and music-are either puerile, inane, or vulgar to the last degree." He goes on to lay most of the blame for this lamentable state of children's music "at the door of the so-called 'Gospel Hymn' and that peculiarly debased class of musical compositions of which they are the type and representative."²¹ Ohl probably had the same type of song in mind when he refers to the common musical fare of the time, steeped in subjectivity, which was taught to children. He writes, "Such teaching does positive injury to the religious nature of the child. It gives the child a false conception of life and duty, and totally wrong views concerning the object and nature of Christian worship; and it may well be questioned whether teaching of this kind is not as destructive in its results as the direct teaching of false doctrine itself."²²

Writing only four years after Ohl, Reddall concedes that songs that like the "Gospel Hymns" may be useful in evangelizing, but that they have no place in the Sunday school. "This is, or should be, the school of the church, and in it we should be training future generations who are to take the places of the present adult members. What sort of Christians and church members will a steady diet of 'Gospel Hymns' and similar invertebrate pabulum produce?"²³ Ohl took the same position in his preface, stating, "the best hymns for children are the Church hymns"²⁴ and "If the Church's music, as well as her hymns, become familiar and dear to the children, there will soon be singing congregations; and to make children realize that, in this

²¹ Frederic Reddall, "Decadence of Sunday School Music," *The Lutheran Church Review*, no. 4 (October 1896): 388.

²² Ohl, *School and Parish Hymnal*, 4.

²³ Reddall, "Decadence," 389.

²⁴ Ohl, *School and Parish Hymnal*, 4.

respect also, they are being prepared for intelligent membership in the adult congregation, is by no means the least among the aims which every Sunday-School must set for itself."²⁵

The positions taken by the 1883 *Sunday School Hymnal*, the *School and Parish Hymnal* by Ohl in 1892, and Reddall in 1896 reveal a reaction against what they saw to be a dire lack of discernment in choosing music for children. Since children were to grow up to be active members of the church, they should be taught the music of the entire congregation, including the best of the received Lutheran hymn tradition. Furthermore, the natural places to affect this education was through the parish schools and Sunday schools. In so doing, the music for children should be largely taken from the adult hymn repertoire-"the best German and Anglican sources,"²⁶ in the case of Ohl's hymnal. Ideally, many of these hymns would have been the same ones sung in the worship services of the congregation.

"Oh, children won't sing church tunes,' says the chorister, 'they want something lively.' Pardon me, dear brother; they *will* sing them, and heartily, if you will only be at the trouble to teach them. It will entail a little more labor on your part, but the result will never be doubtful."²⁷ With these words, Reddall alludes to the fact that children must be taught the hymns well in order to accept and enjoy them. Ohl also emphasizes the importance of a good teacher after describing in more detail the kind of music that is best for children.

²⁵ Ibid., 5.

²⁶ Ibid. Ohl was very interested in the musical heritage of the Lutheran church. He was on the committee that prepared the Common Service of 1888 which sought to analyze the most important of the 16th century Lutheran liturgies and use them to fashion a historically-based liturgical service for English speaking Lutherans in America. He edited the service music that appeared in the 1917 *Common Service Book*. See the preface, United Lutheran Church in America, *Common Service Book of the Lutheran Church* (Philadelphia: The United Lutheran Press, 1917), 310.

²⁷ Reddall, "Decadence," 390.

"The musical language in which they are taught to express their devotions, must be as pure and dignified, and as full of the spirit of devotion, as the hymns themselves. It is a mistake to suppose that children delight only in jingles and swinging dance rhythms. Where this can truthfully be said to be the case, it is not the result of natural inclination, but of a perverted education. An experience of many years, both as an organist and as a pastor, has taught the Editor that children easily perceive the difference between a good and a bad tune; and that they will as readily learn the former as the latter, and prefer it."²⁸

Ohl further expounds on the educational issues involved in teaching church music to children and suggests that the impressionable nature of children requires teachers to choose their material wisely. He also gives a response to those who would say that the texts of church hymns are often above the comprehension of children. He writes,

So are many other things that we teach them. Long before children can understand their full import, we seek to put into their hearts the words of the Ten Commandments, the Creed, the Lord's Prayer, and numerous passages and portions of God's Word; nor do we ourselves understand all the mysteries of the Kingdom of God, even with matured minds and enlightened hearts, and yet we sing of them. It is not so much a question of comprehension as it is a question of faith. '*Believest thou this?*' is the Divine inquiry; and in the hymns that we teach them, as well as in all other Christian instruction, it behooves us therefore early to put 'the form of sound words' into the hearts of our children, that faith may both be nourished and be able to express its adoration in devout and fitting language."²⁹

An 1898 article by William Z. Roy, "The Music of the Sunday-School," lends additional insight into the late 19th century discussion of which sacred music was suitable for Lutheran children. Roy begins by establishing his premise: "The office of sacred music holds a vitally important part in the worship of the Sunday-school. Here, if anywhere in the Christian world, should proper attention be paid to the selection and rendition of music, for here is the

²⁸ Ohl, *School and Parish Hymnal*, 5.

²⁹ *Ibid.*, 5.

fountain-head of the coming generations who in their turn shall collectively rule and govern the Church of the future."³⁰ After making a case for the pipe organ as the ideal accompanying instrument for children, Roy spends a lengthy paragraph advocating the use of children's choirs, made up of the best singers in the Sunday school, to lead the singing in the Sunday school. Roy finishes his paper by focusing on a topic that more closely connects the participation of children with the music of the church: the selection of music. Here, like Ohl and Redall, Roy strongly cautions against the use of music of an emotional nature³¹ and urges the use of the "Grand Old Hymns,"³² citing "A Mighty Fortress Is Our God," "Before Jehovah's Awful Throne," and "Fear Not, O Little Flock, the Foe," as examples. He continues,

Then in music of a quieter nature, we have "Abide With Me," "Thine Forever," "Lead, Kindly Light" and hundreds of others, which while not so majestic as the former have brought comfort to many a soul during the sad hours of grief and affliction. Teach the children these fine old poems of song; so that when they grow into manhood and womanhood they may have the inspired sentiments written indelibly upon their memories and may ever join in raising up their voices to the praise of our Eternal Father, who has given us all our blessings of life, health and his own salvation through Jesus Christ our Lord. Let us therefore render to him our best. Nothing else will do.³³

Several points can be made from Roy's statements. First, by endorsing the use of the "old" hymns, Roy draws a line between hymns whose texts had stood the test of time and those that were more recently written and thus open to the charge of being faddish and sentimental. Second, Roy points out the impressionable nature of children. "Fasten upon their

³⁰ William Z. Roy, "The Music of the Sunday-School," *The Lutheran Church Review* 17, (1898): 143.

³¹ Roy calls them "vile collections of sensational trash which appear under various names-'Moody and Sankey Melodies,' 'Gospel Hymns,' 'Winnowed Songs,' etc.; a horrible product, all through, of latter day sensationalism; many bordering on the ridiculous, to put it mildly; many more reminding their hearers of the dancefloor and music hall...." *Ibid.*, 145-46.

³² *Ibid.*, 146.

³³ *Ibid.*, 147.

retentive memories some grand old hymn and it will be with them all the days of their lives."³⁴

The implication, of course, is that in order for children to retain the best hymnody, they must first be taught it. Lastly, like Ohl in his 1896 hymnal preface, Roy emphasizes that only the best is good enough for children. The image that Roy creates for us shows a time when hymns with superficial texts and musical qualities of questionable merit-at least, according to some-were the norm when it came to the music children sang in their Sunday schools. Although he offers several examples of the hymnody he regards as appropriate for children-and these hymns would likely have been sung in the adult congregation as well-Roy gives no further guidance to the contemporary reader of his day apart from accentuating the value of choosing the old above the new.

The years encompassing 1898 through 1901 saw the yearly meeting of a number of Lutheran church musicians and pastors who met to discuss current issues in church music.³⁵

The papers presented at these four convocations were then compiled and published for the use of the church at large. These twenty-four *Essays on Church Music* addressed a wide variety of topics, four of which pertained to the music of children, giving us additional insight into what the pastoral and musical leaders of the Lutheran church (General Council) thought about the relation of children's music to the music of the church. Not surprisingly, two of the four essays dealt with one of the church's most prominent educational entities for children at the time, the

³⁴ Ibid., 146.

³⁵ The 26th convention of the General Council, meeting in 1897, appointed a committee to organize "an annual convocation of church organists, choirmaster, and pastors of musical taste and ability, within the bounds of the Council, in order to present and discuss questions connected with the rendering of the Lutheran service and with church music in general, that the same may be raised to a higher and more uniform standard, and that the musical treasures of our Church may be made more widely known." General Council of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in North America and S. E. Ochsenford, *Documentary History of the General Council of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in North America* (Philadelphia: General Council Publ. House, 1912), 296.

Sunday school. The first, by George C.F. Haas, was titled "Sunday School Music in Relation to the Service of the Church," and the second, authored by Gomer C. Rees considered "The Festivals of the Sunday School with Reference to Their Music."

Haas, a Lutheran Pastor, begins his essay by laying some philosophical groundwork: Lutherans are distinctive in their Christian beliefs, and therefore their church music should be distinctive as well. Furthermore, the purpose of the Lutheran Sunday school is not chiefly evangelistic or missionary, but, even while these are elements are to be present, the main function is to instruct its own children in the faith, especially in the "absence or insufficiency" of a parochial school. In further distancing the Lutheran system from surrounding evangelical churches, he states a characteristic Lutheran view regarding the education of children in church music.

In distinction from the sectarian view, however, the Lutheran Sunday School recognizes and treats these children as baptized members of the Church and therefore eschews mere emotional means applied with the idea of making Christians of them, but rather builds upon the God-laid foundation by systematic nurture and training in the faith of the Church. For, recognizing as fundamental the things that separate the Lutheran from other Churches, the Lutheran Sunday School also emphasizes the confessional standpoint, keeping herself aloof alike from unionistic and undenominational ideas and practices. Its work being distinctively Lutheran, the music in use in the Lutheran Sunday School can, therefore, be of none other than a Lutheran character, *preparing for the Church service*.³⁶

Once he establishes that the purpose of Sunday school music is to teach the children the music of the church service, Haas highlights a distinguishing feature of this music: "It is marked by adherence to objective principles rather than dependence on subjective moods. It expresses

³⁶ George C. F. Haas, "Sunday School Music in its Relation to the Service of the Church," in *Essays on Church Music, Series 1, Read at First {Philadelphia, 1898} and Second [Pittsburgh, 1899] Convocations*, 1899, 4. Emphasis mine.

not so much individual feeling as the faith of the Church."³⁷ He urges the participation of every individual in the worship of the services and concludes his opening remarks by stating, "From this brief review of what the Lutheran Sunday School and what Lutheran church music is, or should be, it is evident that the relation between them should be a very close one."³⁸

As did Ohl³⁹ and others before him, Haas unreservedly recommends rejecting the prevailing kinds of songs taught to children, "a lot of senseless ditties, manufactured by the yard, and made to sell, but without the shadow of a claim to spirituality, churchliness or even dignity."⁴⁰ He advocates acquiring a "good Lutheran Sunday School hymnbook" and beginning to teach the responses and hymns contained therein.⁴¹ He gives a little more guidance than Roy did before him in regard to the kinds of music children should be taught to sing; he also shows a more relaxed position in regard to the "spiritual songs"-that is, music not necessarily used in the worship of the full congregation:

It will require work and time, but the result will richly repay your trouble. The children will acquire a stock of virile, substantial tunes; the old chorals [sic] of the Church, with their plain melodies, strong harmonies and stately rhythm, the liturgical treasures of our Church used by her in her solemn services, and a selection of spiritual songs, which,

³⁷ Ibid., 4.

³⁸ Ibid.

³⁹ Interestingly, one of Ohl's essays was published in the same collection as that of Haas, suggesting that they took part in the same convocation in either 1898 or 1899. Ohl presented a paper on "Anglican Church Music" and later presented papers at the 1900 and 1901 convocations as well. See *Essays on Church Music, Series 1, Read at First {Philadelphia, 1898} and Second {Pittsburgh, 1899} Convocations*, 1899 and *Essays on Church Music, Series II, Read at Third {New York, 1900} and Fourth {Buffalo, 1901} Convocations. Series*, 1901. The fact that Ohl was present at these convocations where views similar to his own were propounded regarding children and music may indicate a closer interaction between him and those authors than we are able to determine from the documents themselves.

⁴⁰ Haas, "Sunday School Music," 5.

⁴¹ Ibid. In Haas's own words, "stop aping sectarianism and undenominationalism."

though in a more popular strain and not used in the ordinary Church service, are yet in keeping with the rest and do not corrupt the taste for the more substantial music.⁴²

Anticipating a number of possible objections to this course of action, Haas addresses each one in turn. To the charge that church music is not interesting to children, he replies that we should not perpetuate bad taste but "to cultivate the tastes of the young and elevate it." To the objection that the music will be so different from that to which they are typically surrounded, he responds that the music of the church *should* be different from that of the world, saying that "the same argument would strike at the most essential work of the Church; for the Church's Gospel is even less to the taste of the natural man than the Church's music." To the protest that "this old music is too slow and stately...deadening the life in a school," he answers, "That depends in very great measure upon how the music is rendered."⁴³ Here he endorses the lively singing of the chorales and the creative and resolute teaching of the church's music to children.

In concluding his essay, Haas lists several factors that he believes will help strengthen the tie between music of the church and the Sunday school, including using the "treasures of the Church" as the sources for the opening and closing of the school. He also suggests practicing "Church song" as a regular feature in the school work and suggests that the pastors and other leaders in the church support singing of Lutheran music by explaining it when necessary. The two pastors, Haas and Ohl, stand together in their well-developed philosophies of children's music within the educational systems of the church: first, that the hymns be well taught and explained; second, that texts of doctrinal integrity are used; and third, that children

⁴² Ibid.

⁴³ Ibid., 6.

learn hymns that will serve them well as they participate in the worship of the entire congregation.

That at least some Lutheran Sunday schools were already implementing these ideas is evidenced by a brief comment by a Lutheran pastor in a 1902 issue of the *Pennsylvania Herald*, a publication of the Pennsylvania State Sabbath School Association. The May 1 issue was devoted entirely to "Sabbath-School Music" and contains articles by pastors and teachers from a variety of Christian denominations. A thorough reading of the issue provides a fascinating picture of the many viewpoints concerning children's music of the time, with some authors stating that the purpose of Sunday school music is not "to cultivate a taste for good music"⁴⁴ while others propose that "here the very purest and best sacred hymns and songs should be taught them."⁴⁵ One column of the paper, "Difficulties in Securing Good Music," invited input as part of a "Symposium by Prominent Pennsylvania Pastors" and contains short letters giving the opinions of a number of pastors. One of these, Rev. W.M. Rehrig writes,

The music of the General Lutheran Council Sunday-school is of a higher grade than that which is used by the majority of Sunday-schools. We import music from Germany, Sweden, Denmark, etc. Our Sunday-school is preparatory to church service, hence music, hymns, opening and closing services are a part of the church's service. Go to 1522 Arch street [sic], and examine our Sunday-school music. The aim of writers and music committees thus far seems to have been for "popular music." From my standpoint there are no difficulties in the way of securing better music.⁴⁶

⁴⁴ W.F. M'Cauley, "What is Good Sabbath-School Music?" *Pennsylvania Herald*, no. 7, Pennsylvania State Sabbath School Assoc., Lebanon, Pa. (May 1, 1902): 1.

⁴⁵ J.B. Shontz, in "Difficulties in Securing Good Music: Symposium by Prominent Pennsylvania Pastors," *Pennsylvania Herald*, no. 7, Pennsylvania State Sabbath School Assoc., Lebanon, Pa. (May 1, 1902): 2.

⁴⁶ **W.M.** Rehrig, in *Ibid.*, 3.

Rehrig's final sentence implies that to find children's music of high quality, one need look no farther than the hymnal of the church, rather smugly inviting all to come and observe how it works in the Lutheran church!

In his church music essay, Gomer C. Rees focuses on the festivals of the Sunday school.⁴⁷ These were services or programs for the church congregation, with the performance of music by the children as a primary part of the event, often held in the evening hours. Rees first draws a parallel between these festivals and the "festivals" of the church year, arguing that the themes of the Sunday school festival should reflect the current season of the church year. He also proposes using the services of Matins or Vespers as a format for the program, depending on whether it is held in the morning or the evening. In relating the Sunday school festival to the season of the church year in which it takes place and by using Matins or Vespers to frame the program, Rees is encouraging his audience to use the liturgical strengths of the Lutheran church to teach the children, who in turn, would educate their parents and other members of the congregation in attendance. For Rees, the music of the Sunday school directly impacts the music of the church:

We see in the Sunday School the future Church. Whatever influences the Sunday School will in a greater or less degree affect the Church... The musical seed sown in the Sunday School will be received into fertile soil and will bring forth its harvest, either of leaves or fruit, and the future Church will be the reaper.....The musical powers of the Sunday School must be judiciously developed and their force brought to bear on the problem if we would obtain the great results in Church music."⁴⁸

⁴⁷ Gomer C. Rees, "The Festivals of the Sunday School with Reference to Their Music," in *Essays on Church Music, Series 1, Read at First [Philadelphia, 1898] and Second [Pittsburgh, 1899] Convocations*, 1899.

⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, 41.

Like Haas and Ohl, Rees points out the optimal moment of opportunity that childhood provides for educators to mold the lives of children in ways that will "permanently influence their growth and development."⁴⁹

The two *Essays on Church Music* examined thus far were presented either at the 1898 Convocation of pastors and musicians in Philadelphia or the 1899 Convocation in Pittsburgh.⁵⁰ Two additional essays concerning children were published as a result of the 1900 Convocation in New York and the 1901 Convocation held in Buffalo.

The first of these, by A. L. Steimle is titled simply, "Boys Choirs." The author first makes the case for establishing boys choirs in Lutheran churches based on historical precedent and then proposes a number of reasons to support his case. He offers the opinion that instruction of the boys will "give them that musical and churchly training that will make them valuable factors in the Service, and the life of the congregation when they grow up."⁵¹ It also contributes toward "a diffusion of a knowledge of churchliness and of the Church year"⁵² amongst the parents and families of the boys. Steimle also argues for the vesting of the boys choir, its location in the chancel (rather than the balcony), and the regular procession of the boys choir during the opening hymn. That the boys, well instructed by the choirmaster, should be examples of churchly decorum and leaders of the congregation's song is central to his essay. Though Steimle is writing about the benefits to the choir boys in particular, his views can also

⁴⁹ Ibid.

so The published version does not indicate at which Convocation each essay was read.

⁵¹ Steimle, A. L., "Boy Choirs," in *Essays on Church Music, Series II, Read at Third [New York, 1900] and Fourth [Buffalo, 1901] Convocations*, 1901, 70.

⁵² Ibid.

be seen as reflecting a position similar to that of Ohl, Haas, and Rees in regard to the education of children in church music-an instruction that serves them for life as they become adult members of the congregation.

"The Child and Music," by G.C. Berkemeier is the last of the four church music essays that develops a philosophy regarding children and Lutheran church music at the turn of the 20th century. Berkemeier, Director of the Wartburg Orphans' Farm School in Mt.Vernon, Westchester County, New York,⁵³ wrote this article, calling the cultivation of music and song a characteristic and distinguishing feature of their educational program.

Now, as for music, we are profoundly convinced that, next to religion, there is no other power so strong to affect the mind and heart of man, especially of children, as that of music, and that it often proves successful as a last resort, when parental counsels and authority fall powerless upon the child; and for this reason music should be looked upon as one of the chief factors in educational work and should be cultivated as one of the most important branches in the curriculum of the young.⁵⁴

Berkemeier provides a fascinating glimpse into the musical scene of the Orphans' School but also offers commentary on his views regarding children and the music of the church, mainly through the mediation of the Sunday school. Like Ohl, Roy, and Redall before him, Berkemeier refers to an "inferior kind of music intended for children and largely introduced into the homes and Sunday Schools of this country;--1 say *inferior* music and if inferior it certainly should be

⁵³ "Wartburg Orphans' Farm School," in *Annual Report of the State Board of Charities for the Year 1897* (New York and Albany: Wynkoop Hallenbeck Crawford Co., State Printers, 1898), 805-6. The School was established in 1866, shortly after the conclusion of the Civil War, when the need for a home for orphans was acutely felt.

⁵⁴ G.C. Berkemeier, "The Child and Music," in *Essays on Church Music, Series II, Read at Third [New York, 1900] and Fourth [Buffalo, 1901] Convocations*, 1901, 70. Berkemeier may be giving a nod to Luther's well known comment showing his high regard for both music and theology: "Music is an outstanding gift of God and next to theology. I would not want to give up my slight knowledge of music for a great consideration. And youth should be taught this art; for it makes fine, skillful people." Ewald M. Plass, *What Luther Says* (St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House, 1959), 979.

superseded by *superior* music, for only the best is good enough for children."⁵⁵ He describes the "inferior" music as teeming with "meaningless rhymes and sentimental ditties, set to music essentially weak and frivolous in its character."⁵⁶ Perhaps alluding to Ohl's 1892 Hymnal or one of the more recent 1898 Sunday school hymnals of the Norwegian churches⁵⁷ he states, "Happily there has been of late quite a general movement toward better things-but there is yet room for great improvement."⁵⁸ Berkemeier then strikes at the heart of what a child's worship music-especially as taught and used in the Sunday school-should encompass.

The hymns and the music should be no less pure, devout and worshipful in the Sunday School than in the preaching service, because the Sunday School is (or ought to be) a religious service and a preparation for the formal worship in the sanctuary, where the young should be educated and trained for a reverent service in spirit and in truth; because of the power of music either to deepen religious impressions or to dispel and

⁵⁵ Berkemeier, "The Child and Music," 26.

⁵⁶ Ibid.

⁵⁷ At least two hymnals by Norwegian churches were published in 1898. One of these, titled *Church and Sunday-School Hymnal*, was produced by the United Norwegian Lutheran Church of America. The desire to include the best of Lutheran materials is evident from the preface, which states that the purpose of the book was to "make a collection of appropriate English hymns, including such as had already been translated from Lutheran sources, to provide for the translation of others, preferably Norwegian hymns, and to incorporate an Order for Morning, Evening and Sunday-school Service...." In addition to providing a number of hymn tunes that are familiar to Norwegian congregations and schools, the hymnal committee "kept in mind the propriety of providing such hymns, tunes and Order of Service as may train the children of the Church for the public worship of the congregation." United Norwegian Lutheran Church of America, *Church and Sunday-School Hymnal* (Minneapolis : Augsburg Publishing House, 1898), iii. Another Norwegian Synod, The Synod for the Norwegian Evangelical Lutheran Church of America also published a hymnal in 1898, this one titled *Christian Hymns for Church, School and Home*. Its purpose was to serve the entire Synod, including church services, Sunday Schools, parish schools, and the family at home. Hymns 278-309 are designated, "Hymns for Children," but the Preface states, "In the Sunday School, not only the Special Hymns for Children, but also the church hymns should be used." This gives clear indication that children were to be taught from the larger hymnic repertoire of the congregation; indeed, they would have in their hands the same hymnal used in the regular worship services of the congregation. That a preface to a hymnal for the entire congregation would single out a direction for music in the Sunday school demonstrates the value this Lutheran synod placed on the worship education of their children, through the music of the church. Synod for the Norwegian Evangelical Lutheran Church in America, *Christian Hymns for Church, School and Home* (Decorah, Iowa: Lutheran Pub. House, 1898), iii.

⁵⁸ Berkemeier, "The Child and Music," 27. As previously noted, J.F. Ohl was likely one of those present when Berkemeier read his paper at the 1900 or 1901 Convocation, having two of his own papers included in the Essays on Church Music later published as part of a record of the proceedings.

efface them by exciting superficial and frivolous emotions; because in the words used a mischievous distortion of the truth, an unwarrantable fancy of the imagination, or an insidious heresy may become more easily and firmly fastened in the mind by rhymes and music than in any other way."⁵⁹

The author adds to this by urging the careful deliberation by congregations when they are choosing their Sunday school hymnals. "By all means keep out of your Sunday School the trash of our next neighbors, hymnals which are and must be to the taste of an educated Lutheran very loathsome, not only on account of the 'crooked theology' lurking therein, but also on account of the very inferior musical and lyrical quality; jingling effusions, which are often flippantly irreverent, especially in the use of the names of our Savior."⁶⁰ He encourages the use of the chorale in the Sunday school and deems it a "great mistake to suppose that even children cannot be interested in them if they are only properly introduced."⁶¹ Berkemeier's position as the director in a school for orphans would seem to give him a different voice among the other writers on children and church music examined in this paper, many of whom were pastors of congregations. Although his circumstances are, indeed, unique, his convictions on the worth of teaching children the best of the church's music to give them a theological grounding in Lutheranism that will abide with them through their entire lives are remarkably congruent with his contemporaries writing on the topic.

⁵⁹ Ibid.

⁶⁰ Ibid.

⁶¹ Ibid., 28.

Several Lutheran hymnals published after the Convocations of pastors and church musicians reflect similar views relating to church music for children.⁶² For instance, E.C. Crank's *Hymnal for the Sunday School* published in 1910 for the United Synod of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in the South states the necessary carefulness in selection of hymnody that accords with the heritage found in the hymns of the church:

A widespread and generally recognized need for a book of dignified, churchly, singable hymns and tunes is the reason for the existence of the *Hymnal For the Sunday School*. The effort of the compiler has been to select hymns that teach truth, and music of real beauty and worth, which will train the Sunday Schools in the use and appreciation of the great hymns of the Church. While the new hymns of worth have been introduced, the effort has been to give the good rather than the new.⁶³

Hymns and Songs for the Sunday School, published in 1914 by the Lutheran Publication Society reflects a similar theme but draws an even more explicit tie between the music for children in the Sunday school and the music of the church. It also unapologetically states that one of the purposes of Sunday school music is to cultivate a child's proper taste in church music.

The conviction that only the noblest and best in music is worthy of a place in divine worship has guided the editor of *Hymns and Songs for the Sunday School* in the selection of his material. There is a clear distinction between music suitable for the world and music suitable for the church. This distinction should be observed in the Sunday school, which has no existence apart from the church. Here the child first learns to take part in public worship; here he should use only such music as has been conceived in the spirit of religion and has been cast into forms consistent with that spirit. By furnishing such music the Sunday school establishes for the child correct taste

⁶² The 1901 hymnal of the Augustana Synod (Swedish) is unique in being intended for both the church and the Sunday schools. There is no distinction between children's hymns and hymns for adults in the book. It contains Morning and Evening Services and Services with Holy Communion in addition to an "Order of Service for the Sunday School" at the end of the section containing sung orders of worship. The preface states simply, "The Hymnal with music is herewith placed before our congregations." Evangelical Lutheran Augustana Synod of North America, *Hymnal and Order of Service for Churches and Sunday-Schools* (Rock Island, Ill.: Lutheran Augustana Book Concern, 1901), 3.

⁶³ E.C. Crank, *Hymnal for the Sunday School* (Columbia, S.C.: Lutheran Board of Publication, 1910), 3.

in religious music. Failing to set before him such examples, the Sunday school loses a great opportunity.⁶⁴

The last hymnal to be considered for its use of children's music, unlike the others discussed, makes no claims as a Sunday school hymnal; it is the *Common Service Book* of the Lutheran Church, published in 1917 by the Lutheran Church in America. In 1888, the Common Service (referring to the sung and spoken liturgies of the Lutheran church) was first published as a collaborative effort by the major English speaking Lutheran bodies in America. The Common Service was derived from a study of the liturgies most used in the 16th century church of the Lutheran Reformation. Including these revised liturgies and abiding by the same scholarship guidelines, these Lutheran church bodies-as a prelude to their merging into one synod published the *Common Service Book* in 1917.⁶⁵ This book also contained hymnody, including a section of 49 hymns for "Children and Young People." While nothing in the hymnal's preface points to the use of these hymns in Sunday school or parish school settings, the fact that they appear in the official hymnal of the United Lutheran Church points to the fact that the hymnal editors regarded the musical involvement of the church's children as a part of the regular life of the congregation. This comes as no surprise considering the attention that pastors and church musicians of the General Council had given to children's music in the decades leading up to the

⁶⁴ Harold Lewars, *Hymns and Songs for the Sunday School* (Philadelphia: Lutheran Publication Society, 1914), 3.

⁶⁵ The General Synod South, the General Synod, and the General Council were the three Lutheran Synods who collaborated on producing the Common Service in 1888. These three merged in 1918. See Luther D. Reed, *The Lutheran Liturgy: A Study of the Common Service of the Lutheran Church in America* (Philadelphia: Muhlenberg Press, 1947), 202-3. See also General Synod of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in the United States, *The Common Service for the Use of Evangelical Lutheran Congregations* (Philadelphia: Lutheran Publications Society, 1888), xxix-xxx.

1917 publication. It also lends support to the possibility that the hymnal was placed in the hands of children in the parochial schools and Sunday schools.⁶⁶

Looking into the use of church music in Lutheran parochial schools will round out the discussion up to the year 1933, when the text book *Music Reader for Lutheran Schools* was published. The parochial schools⁶⁷ of the Lutheran Church-Missouri Synod will be discussed specifically, as that church's system of parish schools was regarded as preeminent among Lutheran schools in America at the turn of the century.⁶⁸

According to *The Lutheran Cyclopedia* (1899), pastors had oversight of all parochial schools, and hymns took their place beside Bible history, Catechism and Bible reading as the textbooks for religious instruction-"the distinguishing feature of all parish schools."⁶⁹ The Missouri Synod in 1847 "published its first hymnal, which, in addition to its use in church services, was used as the text for the school music program until 1894. At that time a songbook entitled, *Liederper/en*, was published for use in the schools...About two-thirds of the songs were German chorales."⁷⁰ Singing in the schools comprised the main musical education activity.

⁶⁶ It should be noted that J.F. Ohl, a passionate advocate of children's participation in church music, as we have seen, was on the hymnal committee, writing a number of hymn tunes, chairing the music subcommittee, and providing "general editorial supervision of the music." Reed, *The Lutheran Liturgy*, 201-2.

⁶⁷ In the literature, as in this study, the terms "parish school," "parochial school," and "day school" are used interchangeably.

⁶⁸ "From this centre principally the interest in parochial schools gradually radiated in every direction, until all Luth. Bodies in the United States took up the question with more or less zeal, and these educational institutions soon became indispensable adjuncts of the Church in the Middle and Western States." Jacobs, et al., "Parochial Schools" in *The Lutheran Cyclopedia*, 367.

⁶⁹ Ibid.

⁷⁰ Bernard Gastler, "A Study of the Music of the Lutheran Hymnal as a Tool for Musical Growth in the Lutheran Elementary School" (**M.M.** Thesis, University of Texas, Austin, 1963), 14. In his review of church hymns and Lutheran educational practice during this time period, Gastler cites three other important sources: Leslie Zeddies, "Music Education Principles and Practices in the Elementary Schools of the Lutheran Church-Missouri

Learning the German chorales in the context of the school day enabled children to participate in the worship of the congregation on Sundays.⁷¹ While *Liederperlen* also contained folksongs from England, America, and Germany, the book was not a comprehensive music education text.⁷² This was to change with the 1920 publication of *Select Songs for School and Home* by the official publishing arm of the Missouri Synod, Concordia Publishing House.

Select Songs, compiled by J.A. Theiss, included an "Introduction on the Rudiments of Music by Karl Haase."⁷³ Meant to be used as the main teaching tool for music in the Lutheran schools, the book bears a striking resemblance to a Lutheran hymnal. It is arranged according to the church year with the seasons of Advent through Trinity comprising the first 55 hymns. The next seventy songs are all sacred songs and hymns, with German chorales in English translations represented in hymns such as "Thee Will I Love, My Strength, My Tower (100)," "Now Thank We All Our God (85)," and "A Mighty Fortress is Our God (66)" each rendered with the original rhythmic forms of their tunes.

The preface to the book states that the General School Board of the Missouri Synod published the book to answer a growing demand for a book in English that was similar to *Liederperlen*. It clearly states its intended use to educate children in the music of the church:

Synod," PhD diss., Northwestern University, 1959); H. Ninnemann, "Music in Our Schools," *Lutheran School Journal* 56 (July 1921): 193-196; and H.M. Zurstadt, "The General Curriculum: Music," *Lutheran School Journal* 62 (September 1927): 323-331.

⁷¹ "The singing of church music played a major role in Lutheran school music activities before 1900 for two reasons, First...this was the only music readily available. Secondly, these Lutherans were intent upon their children learning the chorales in order that they might participate in congregational singing. The school was considered the chief place where the children could learn the chorales." Gastler, "A Study of the Music of the Lutheran Hymnal," 15.

⁷² Ibid., 14.

⁷³ J.A. Theiss, and Karl Haase, *Select Songs for School and Home* (St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House, 1920).

"Since this volume is above all to serve our Lutheran schools, the church-hymn has been given a prominent place."⁷⁴ The close connection between the clergy of the church and the teaching in the school can be noted by the six pastors who are listed in the preface as contributing English translations and providing editorial assistance. The fact that the book includes "Home" in its title demonstrates the compiler's intent for these songs of the church to be used in family devotions as well.

More deliberate attention to the needs of music education are evident in the final publication reviewed in this article, *The Music Reader for Lutheran Schools*. First published in 1933, the *Music Reader* is subtitled a "One Book Course" and takes songs from four previous Missouri Synod books—the *Evangelical Lutheran Hymn-book*,⁷⁵ *Gesangbuch*,⁷⁶ *Select Songs*, and *Liederperlen*;⁷⁷ orders them according to developmental levels for use in the various school grades; and signifies the building blocks of music reading to be learned each step of the way. It is a curriculum that draws from "the unsurpassed hymnology and healthy children's music of our own,"⁷⁸ according to the preface, and holds up the chorale as a distinguishing mark of

⁷⁴ Ibid., 3.

⁷⁵ English Evangelical Lutheran Synod of Missouri and Other States, *Evangelical Lutheran Hymn-Book* (Pittsburg: American Lutheran Publication Board, 1909). Although this hymnbook was first printed in 1889, the 1909 edition or printing would have been the most recent to the compilers of *The Music Reader*.

⁷⁶ Deutsche Evangelisch-Lutherische Synode von Missouri, Ohio und Anderen Staaten, *Kirchengesangbuch für Evangelisch-Lutherische Gemeinden ungeiindeter Augsburgischer Konfession: darin des sel. Dr. Martin Luthers und anderer geistreicher Lehrer gebriuchlichste Kirchenlieder enthalten sind* (St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House), 1917. (Earlier editions or printings also existed.)

⁷⁷ Gastler gives the date for *Liederperlen* as 1894, citing Zeddies. Gastler, "A Study of the Music of the Lutheran Hymnal," 14. Apart from this, no precise bibliographical data could be determined by the author.

⁷⁸ J. Grundmann and B. Schumacher, *Music Reader for Lutheran Schools: One-Book Course* (St. Louis: Concordia Pub. House, 1933), iii. The preface also gives an interesting reference to the kind of music used in public schools of the time: "The best in public-school music is taken from our Lutheran treasure of hymns and standard children's songs; why should we look or 'better material?'" Ibid.

Lutheran music, "a positive means of building up a Lutheran, Christian consciousness."

Lutheran chorales and children's music "are a treasure. If we hope to retain this treasure, it will avail us nothing to have it in print; it must be learned by the children." The preface argues for safeguarding the "treasure" of the Lutheran chorales not from a simple preservationist mindset but because they proclaim Christian truth, and to *not* read or sing what is in line with the teachings of the faith opens the possibility for us to "sing ourselves out of Lutheranism and Christianity."⁷⁹

This emphasis on children's hymns maintaining the doctrinal purity of the Lutheran church was the same concern found fifty years earlier in the Sunday school hymnal prefaces of John Spielman in 1883 and J.F. Ohl in 1892. The extensive parochial school system of the Missouri Synod Lutheran churches enabled this church body to focus on education in an even more intensive way than the Sunday schools could do, using their corpus of hymns as teaching material. Furthermore, the 1933 *Music Reader* states unambiguously the place for church music in the schools:

Therefore, since one of the chief aims of the Lutheran school is to prepare children for Lutheran church-membership and for a Christian life, in both of which the character of music learned in childhood plays a very important part, it is the part of wisdom to utilize our own unsurpassed *chorales* and other classics both as practise [sic] material and as a body of songs to be worked over into the repertory of the individual as a lasting treasure. A child cannot be brought up on any kind of song material and then be expected to appreciate his own church music or the classic folk-songs of his own people. He must be brought up in this music itself.⁸⁰

⁷⁹ Ibid.

so Ibid., iv.

Although the authors of the sources consulted for this study came from a variety of Lutheran synods and geographical locations throughout the United States, their views concerning the teaching of church music, in the form of liturgy and hymnody, were remarkably consistent. First, they pointed out the need for children to be educated in the music of the church; some authors point out that children are more apt to learn this type of music when instructed by a skilled educator. Secondly, they stressed the need for doctrinal integrity in the hymns to be sung by the children; often the Lutheran chorale tradition was invoked to exemplify the best of the text and tunes to be used. The last thread that runs throughout the sources studied flows from the first two: along with theologically sound hymns, ably taught, will come an active participation by children in the congregation as they continue to serve throughout their years within the congregation.

In his essay *The Child and Music*, G.S. Berkemeier, in a flowery style not uncommon to the late 19th century, brings together his concluding thoughts in the following words; they also serve as a fitting conclusion to this study of children and church music at the turn of the 20th century:

May it ever be true among us that the love of God comes first; then as second the love of children and our love for children sanctified by the love of God-and then the love of music, not third, but as the refining influence pervading and in conjunction with both-God, children and music, these three, they will suffice to antedate the bliss of Heaven!⁸¹

⁸¹ Berkemeier, "The Child and Music," 28.

Bibliography

- Berkemeier, G.C. "The Child and Music." In *Essays on Church Music, Series II. Read at Third [New York, 1900] and Fourth [Buffalo, 1901] Convocations*, 1901.
- Bruinsma, Henry A. Review of "A Study of Music Education in the Elementary Schools of the Lutheran Church-Missouri Synod, and Recommendations for Its Improvement and Extension." *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, no. 30 (1972): 44-46.
- Cronk, E. C. *Hymnal for the Sunday School*. Columbia, S.C.: Lutheran Board of Publication, 1910.
- Deutsche Evangelisch-Lutherische Synode von Missouri, Ohio und Anderen Staaten. *Kirchengesangbuch für Evangelisch-Lutherische Gemeinden ungeeinderter Augsburgischer Konfession: darin des sel. Dr. Martin Luthers und anderer geistreicher Lehrer gebriiuchlichste Kirchen/ieder enthalten sind*. St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House, 1917.
- Eatherton, Samuel J. "Lutheran Sunday School Hymnals in English-1819-1901." Baylor University, 2015.
- English Evangelical Lutheran Synod of Missouri and Other States. *Evangelical Lutheran Hymn-Book*. Pittsburg: American Lutheran Publication Board, 1909.
- Evangelical Lutheran Augustana Synod of North America. *Hymnal and Order of Service for Churches and Sunday-Schools*. Rock Island, Ill.: Lutheran Augustana Book Concern, 1901.
- Evangelical Lutheran Church. *Hymns for Sunday-Schools*. Philadelphia: Lutheran Board of Publications, 1860.
- Evangelical Lutheran Joint Synod of Ohio and Other States. *School Carols: A Collection of Hymns for the Sunday Schools*. Columbus, Ohio: Lutheran Book Concern, 1914.
- Evangelical Lutheran Joint Synod of Ohio and Other States. *The Sunday School Hymnal: a Collection of Music for Sunday and Week-Day Schools with Full Responsive Services for Sundays and Festivals*. Columbus, Ohio: Lutheran Book Concern, 1883.
- Gastler, Bernard. "A Study of the Music of the Lutheran Hymnal as a Tool for Musical Growth in the Lutheran Elementary School." Master's thesis, University of Texas, Austin, 1963.
- General Council of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in North America. *Little Children's Book for Schools and Families*. Philadelphia: J.C. File, 1885.

General Council of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in America. *Sunday-School Book for the Use of Evangelical Lutheran Congregations*. Philadelphia: Lutheran Book Store, 1873.

General Council of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in North America and S. E. Ochsenford. *Documentary History of the General Council of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in North America*. Philadelphia: General Council Publishing House, 1912.

General Synod of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in the United States. *The Common Service for the Use of Evangelical Lutheran Congregations*. Philadelphia: Lutheran Publications Society, **1888**.

Giesselman, Harry. "A Study of Music Education in the Elementary Schools of the Lutheran Church--Missouri Synod, and Recommendations for Its Improvement and Extension." Ed. D. diss., Columbia University, 1964.

Grundmann, J., and B. Schumacher. *Music Reader for Lutheran Schools, One-Book Course*. St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House, 1933.

Haas, George C. F. "Sunday School Music in its Relation to the Service of the Church," in *Essays on Church Music. Series 1. Read at First [Philadelphia, 1898] and Second [Pittsburgh, 1899] Convocations*. 1899.

Jacobs, Henry Eyster, John Augustus William Haas, and Otto Zockler. *The Lutheran Cyclopedia*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1899.

Klammer, Edward W. *Our Songs of Praise*. St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House, 1953.

Lewars, Harold. *Hymns and Songs for the Sunday School*. Lutheran Publication Society, 1914.

Luther, Martin. *Selected Psalms I*, Vol. 12, *Luther's Works, American Edition*. St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House and Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1968.

Marty, Martin E. *The Mystery of the Child*. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 2007.

Ninnemann, H. "Music in Our Schools." *Lutheran School Journal* 56 (July 1921): 193-196.

Ohl, J. F. (Jeremiah Franklin). *School and Parish Hymnal with Tunes*. Philadelphia: G.W. Frederick, 1892.

Pennsylvania State Sabbath School Association, Lebanon, Pa. "Sabbath-School Music." Special issue, *Pennsylvania Herald* 8, no. 7 (May 1902).

Plass, Ewald M. *What Luther Says*. St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House, 1959.

- Reddall, Frederic. "Decadence of Sunday School Music." *The Lutheran Church Review*, no. 4 (October 1896): 387-391.
- Reed, Luther D. *The Lutheran Liturgy: a Study of the Common Service of the Lutheran Church in America*. Philadelphia: Muhlenberg Press, 1947.
- Rees, Gomer C. "The Festivals of the Sunday School with Reference to Their Music." In *Essays on Church Music, Series 1. Read at First [Philadelphia, 1898] and Second [Pittsburgh, 1899] Convocations*, 1899.
- Roedel, W. D. *Carmina Ecclesia?: a Collection of Sacred Music Consisting of New, Original, And Select Hymn Tunes, Anthems and Chants, Adapted Particularly to the Hymn-book of the General Synod of the Evangelical Lutheran Church, the Lutheran Church Service, and Every Occasion of Public Worship*. 2d ed. rev. and cor. Baltimore: T.N. Kurtz, 1862.
- Roseland, Jens Christian. "Rev. J.F. Ohl, A.M." In *American Lutheran Biographies: Or, Historical Notices of Over Three Hundred and Fifty Leading Men of the American Lutheran Church, from Its Establishment to the Year 1890; with a Historical Introduction and Numerous Portrait Engravings* (Milwaukee, Wis: Press of A. Houtkamp & Son), 1890.
- Roy, William Z. "The Music of the Sunday-School." *The Lutheran Church Review* 17 (1898): 143-147.
- Schalk, Carl. *God's Song in a New Land: Lutheran Hymnals in America*. St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House, 1995.
- _____. *Luther on Music: Paradigms of Praise*. St. Louis: Concordia, 1988.
- Steimle, A. L. "Boy Choirs." In *Essays on Church Music, Series II. Read at Third [New York, 1900] and Fourth [Buffalo, 1901] Convocations. Series II*, 1901.
- Synod for the Norwegian Evangelical Lutheran Church in America. *Christian Hymns for Church, School and Home*. Decorah: Lutheran Publishing House, **1898**.
- Theiss, J. A. and Karl Haase. *Select Songs for School and Home*. St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House, 1920.
- United Lutheran Church in America. *Common Service Book of the Lutheran Church*. Philadelphia: The United Lutheran Press, 1917.
- United Norwegian Lutheran Church of America. *Church and Sunday-School Hymnal*. Minneapolis: Augsburg Publishing House, 1898.

r-

Vieker, Jon D. "The Father's Faith, the Children's Song: Missouri Lutheranism Encounters American Evangelicalism in Its Hymnals, Hymns Writers, and Hymns, 1889-1912." PhD diss., Concordia Seminary, St. Louis, 2014.

"Wartburg Orphans' Farm School." In *Annual Report of the State Board of Charities for the Year 1897*. New York and Albany: Wynkoop Hallenbeck Crawford Co., State Printers (1898): **805-806**.

Zeddies, Leslie, "Music Education Principles and Practices in the Elementary Schools of the Lutheran Church-Missouri Synod." PhD diss., Northwestern University, 1959.

Zurstadt, H.M. *Curriculum in Music for Lutheran Schools; Prepared Under the Direction of the Curriculum Committee of the Board of Christian Education of the Evangelical Lutheran Synod of Missouri, Ohio, and Other States*. St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House, 1936.

_____. "The General Curriculum: Music." *Lutheran School Journal* 62 (September 1927): 323-331.